

Investigation report no. BI-710 and BI-711

Licensee	WIN Television Qld Pty Ltd (the Licensee)	
Relevant legislation/standard	Broadcasting Services Act 1992 (the BSA) Broadcasting Services (Television Captioning) Standard 2023 (the Standard)	
Findings	Breach of subsection 130ZZA(4) in Part 9D of the BSA [which requires a commercial television licensee to comply with the Standard] Breach of paragraph 7(1)(o) of Schedule 2 to the BSA [licence condition requiring compliance with applicable provisions in Part 9D of the BSA]	
Programs	A Remarkable Place to Die and Chicago Med	
Dates of broadcast	24 November 2024 (9pm to 11pm) and 2 December 2024 (10.37pm to 11.28pm), respectively	
Type of service	Commercial – television	
Attachments	 A – Extract of complaint to the ACMA B – Relevant provisions of the BSA and the Standard C – Table of identified non-compliance breaches in relation to the broadcasts D – Extract of Licensee's submission to the ACMA 	

Background

On 23 December 2024, the Australian Communications and Media Authority (the ACMA) commenced an investigation under the BSA into the broadcasts by WIN Television Qld Pty Ltd (the Licensee) of A Remarkable Place to Die (Program 1) and Chicago Med (Program 2) (collectively, the Programs).

A Remarkable Place to Die and Chicago Med are drama programs broadcast by the Licensee on 24 November and 2 December 2024, respectively. The Programs contained pre-recorded captions.

The ACMA received a complaint alleging that captions for phrases and sentences were missing from the Programs, which meant that the complainant missed the meaning of what the speakers were saying. An excerpt of the complaint to the ACMA is at Attachment A.

The ACMA has investigated the Licensee's compliance with subsection 130ZZA(4) of the BSA, and the licence condition imposed by paragraph 7(1)(o) of Schedule 2 to the BSA.

Legislative framework

The licensee was required to provide captioning services for the Programs.

Subsection 130ZZA(4) of the BSA imposes an obligation on commercial television broadcasting licensees to comply with the Standard determined by the ACMA under subsection 130ZZA(1) of the BSA. Subsection 130ZZA(4) is in Part 9D of the BSA and therefore compliance with the Standard is a licence condition for commercial television broadcasting licensees under paragraph 7(1)(o) of Schedule 2 to the BSA.

The Standard establishes minimum requirements relating to the quality of captioning services to ensure that captions are meaningful to deaf and hard-of-hearing viewers. 1 Specifically, the Standard requires captions to be readable, accurate and comprehensible.2

A 'captioning service' is defined in section 6 of the Standard as 'a service in which captions are provided for programs that enable the viewer to follow the speakers, dialogue, action, sound effects and music of a program'.

'Captions' is defined in section 6 of the Standard as 'the visual translation of the soundtrack of a program in English, in word form'.

The Standard stipulates that the quality of a captioning service for a program must be considered in the context of the program as a whole.3 When determining the quality of a captioning service for a program, the cumulative effect of the readability, accuracy and comprehensibility of the captions must be considered.4

Relevant provisions of the BSA and the Standard are set out in Attachment B.

Assessment of a television program

Paragraph 9(a) of the Standard states:

Subject to paragraph (b), when determining the quality of a captioning service for a program, the captioning service must be considered in the context of the program as a whole.

Accordingly, in the case of a TV drama program, the quality of the captioning service must be considered in the context of the program as a whole.

¹ Section 5 of the Standard.

² Paragraphs 10(a), 11(a) and 12(a) of the Standard.

³ Paragraph 9(a) of the Standard.

⁴ Paragraph 9(c) of the Standard.

Assessment of the broadcasts

The ACMA has assessed whether the captioning service for the Programs broadcast on 24 November and 2 December 2024 complied with the requirements relating to quality set out in the Standard. The outcome of this assessment determines whether the Licensee has complied with the Standard and, therefore, the licence condition.

Program 1 – A Remarkable Place to Die

Program 1 was approximately 2 hours in duration, comprising 90 minutes of drama footage and 32 minutes of commercials (the commercials have not been assessed as advertising matter is not included in the definition of a 'program' for the purpose of the captioning obligations imposed by Part 9D of the BSA).

Program 2 - Chicago Med

Program 2 was approximately 50 minutes in duration, comprising 38 minutes of drama footage and 12 minutes of commercials (again, the commercials have not been assessed).

The table at **Attachment C** lists the relevant captioning compliance issues in relation to the Programs.

Issue 1: Did the Licensee comply with the Standard and, accordingly, comply with subsection 130ZZA(4) of the BSA?

Finding

The Licensee failed to comply with the Standard, in breach of subsection 130ZZA(4) of the BSA.

Reasons

The ACMA's assessment of the Programs has found that there were captioning compliance issues in both broadcasts. These issues are set out in the table at **Attachment C.**

The ACMA considers that the cumulative effect of the captioning compliance issues relating to accuracy and comprehensibility in the Programs is significant enough to warrant a finding that the captioning of the Programs was not meaningful to deaf and hard-of-hearing viewers.

Examples of captioning compliance issues relating to accuracy and comprehensibility in the Programs include, but are not limited to, the following:

Program 1

- There was an issue with accuracy because every second or third line of dialogue (when an actor was speaking continuously) was not captioned and/or not captioned verbatim. For example:
 - The words at 20:15:40: 'We think the shovel is something he had with him. Martyn Fearnly the volunteer who does the tours says there were no hand tools on display in that tunnel'
 - were captioned as: 'We think the shovel is Martyn Fearnley, says there were no hand tools on'
- There was also an issue with comprehensibility because the captions did not identify the different speakers. While it was apparent from the footage who was speaking at some times, it was not evident at other times, and this adversely affected the comprehensibility of the captions.

Program 2

- There was an issue with accuracy because every second or third line of dialogue (when an actor was speaking continuously) was not captioned and/or not captioned verbatim. For example:
 - The words at 22:46:19: 'Any chance these are early signs of pregnancy? We've been trying. Well, it's hard to say, but we can get a full work up, including pregnancy test. Sound good?
 - were captioned as: 'Any chance these We've been trying. But we can get a full work up, sound good?

• There was also an issue with comprehensibility because the captions did not identify the different speakers. While it was apparent from the footage who was speaking at some times, it was not evident at other times, and this adversly affected the comprehensibility of the captions.

The captioning compliance issues, such as spoken content not being captioned (subparagraph 11(b)(i) of the Standard); spoken content not being captioned verbatim (subparagraph 11(b)(ii) of the Standard); and captions not identifying individual speakers (subparagraph 12(b)(i) of the Standard); were material because they made it difficult for deaf and hard-of-hearing viewers to follow the meaning of the Programs. As a result, the Programs were not meaningful to deaf and hard-of-hearing viewers.

Conclusion

The ACMA finds that the cumulative effect of the captioning issues relating to accuracy and comprehensibility in Program 1 (totalling 90 minutes of drama footage) and Program 2 (totalling approximately 38 minutes of drama footage) resulted in the captioning service for the Programs not meeting the requirements relating to quality imposed by the Standard.

Issue 2: Did the Licensee comply with paragraph 7(1)(o) of Schedule 2 to the BSA?

Finding

The Licensee failed to comply with subsection 130ZZA(4) of the BSA, in breach of the licence condition at paragraph 7(1)(o) of Schedule 2 to the BSA.

Reasons

The ACMA's view is that by failing to comply with the requirements relating to quality imposed by the Standard, the Licensee failed to comply with subsection 130ZZA(4) of the BSA, and that failure meant that the Licensee also failed to comply with the licensee condition at paragraph 7(1)(o) of Schedule 2 to the BSA.

Attachment A

Extract of complaint to the ACMA

Captioning misses sentences during numerous programmes.

Phrases and sentences were missing from all of these examples. It is very annoying as the whole gist of what the person is saying can be missed.

Relevant provisions of the BSA and the Standard Broadcasting Services Act 1992

Section 130ZR of Part 9D of the BSA

Captioning obligations-basic rule

Basic rule

- (1) Each commercial television broadcasting licensee, and each national broadcaster, must provide a captioning service for:
 - (a) television programs transmitted during designated viewing hours; and
 - (b) television news or current affairs programs transmitted outside designated viewing hours.

Section 130ZZA of Part 9D of the BSA

Captioning standards

- (1) The ACMA may, by legislative instrument, determine standards that relate to:
 - (a) the quality of captioning services provided by commercial television broadcasting licensees for television programs; [...]

[...]

(4) A commercial television broadcasting licensee must comply with a standard determined under subsection (1).

[...]

Schedule 2 to the BSA

7 Conditions of commercial television broadcasting licences

(1) Each commercial television broadcasting licence is subject to the following conditions:

[...]

(o) if a provision of Part 9D (which deals with captioning of television programs for the deaf and hearing impaired) applies to the licensee—the licensee will comply with that provision.

Broadcasting Services (Television Captioning) Standard 2023

5 Object of this Standard

The object of this standard is to specify mandatory requirements for broadcasters and narrowcasters that relate to the quality of captioning services, to ensure that captioning services are meaningful to deaf and hard of hearing viewers.

6 Definitions

In this Standard:

Terms that are defined in the *Broadcasting Services Act 1992* have the same meaning as in that Act, unless the contrary intention appears.

[...]

captioning obligations means the legislative obligations under Part 9D of the Act that require:

(a) commercial television broadcasting licensees and national broadcasters to provide a captioning service for programs transmitted under subsection 130ZR(1) of the Act;

[...]

captioning service means a service in which captions are provided for programs that enable the viewer to follow the speakers, dialogue, action, sound effects and music of a program.

captions means the visual translation of the soundtrack of a program in English, in word form.

distinct program segment within a television program means a distinct segment that is unrelated to other program segments within the same television program.

[...]

program includes:

- (a) a television program; and
- (b) a distinct program segment within a television program.

[...]

8 Quality of captioning services

Broadcasters and narrowcasters must, when providing a captioning service in accordance with their captioning obligations, comply with the requirements relating to quality in this Standard.

Note: In exercising its enforcement powers under the Act, the ACMA takes the position that a program that does not meet the requirements of section 8 of this Standard will not be eligible to be used by a broadcaster or narrowcaster to comply with its captioning obligations.

9 Determining the quality of captioning services

- (a) Subject to paragraph (b), when determining the quality of a captioning service for a program, the captioning service must be considered in the context of the program as a whole.
- (b) When determining the quality of a captioning service for a program that is a distinct program segment within a television program, the captioning service must be considered in the context of that distinct program segment on its own.
- (c) When determining the quality of a captioning service, the cumulative effect of the following factors must be considered:

- (i) the readability of the captions;
- (ii) the accuracy of the captions; and
- (iii) the comprehensibility of the captions.

[...]

10 Readability of captions

- (a) When providing a captioning service for a program, broadcasters and narrowcasters must use captions that are readable.
- (b) When determining whether captions are readable, the following factors must be considered in the context of the program as a whole:
 - (i) whether colour and font are used in the captions in a way that makes them legible;
 - (ii) whether the caption lines end at natural linguistic breaks and reflect the natural flow and punctuation of a sentence, so each caption forms an understandable segment;
 - (iii) whether standard punctuation of printed English has been used in the captions to convey the way speech is delivered;
 - (iv) whether the captions are positioned so as to avoid obscuring other on- screen text, any part of a speaker's face including the mouth and any other important visuals where possible; and
 - (v) whether the captions are no more than three lines in length.

11 Accuracy of captions

- (a) When providing a captioning service for a program, broadcasters and narrowcasters must use captions that accurately recreate the soundtrack of a program.
- (b) When determining whether captions accurately recreate the soundtrack of a program, the following factors must be considered in the context of the program as a whole:
 - (i) whether spoken content has been captioned;
 - (ii) whether the captions of spoken content are verbatim
 - (iii) where it is not possible for the captions of spoken content to be verbatim, whether the captions reflect the actual meaning of the spoken content;
 - (iv) where the intended target audience of a program is children and the captions are not verbatim, the extent to which the captions take into account the intended audience;
 - (v) whether the manner and tone of voice of speakers has been conveyed, where practical and material; and
 - (vi) whether sound effects and/or music, material to understanding the program and not observable from the visual action, have been accurately described.

12 Comprehensibility of captions

- (a) When providing a captioning service for a program, broadcasters and narrowcasters must use captions that are comprehensible.
- (b) When determining whether captions are comprehensible, the following factors must be considered in the context of the program as a whole:

- (i) whether the captions clearly identify and distinguish individual speakers, including off-screen and off-camera voices:
- (ii) whether the captions are displayed for a sufficient length of time to allow the viewer to read them and follow the action of the program;
- (iii) the extent to which the appearance of the caption coincides with the onset of speech of the corresponding speaker, sound effect or music;
- (iv) the extent to which the disappearance of the caption coincides with the end of the speech of the corresponding speaker, sound effect or music;
- (v) whether the words used in the captions have been spelt correctly;
- (vi) where a word is not spelt correctly, whether the spelling provided nevertheless conveys the meaning of the actual word;
- (vii) whether explanatory captions are provided for long speechless pauses in the program;
- (viii) the extent to which a caption over-runs a shot or scene change; and
- (ix) the extent to which the appearance or disappearance of the caption, as the case may be, coincides with the relevant shot or scene change.

TABLE OF IDENTIFIED BREACHES AND ASSOCIATED KEY ISSUES

Breach due to captioning compliance issues identified in the Programs. The captioning issues affected the accuracy and/or comprehensibility of the Programs to such an extent that they would have made it difficult for a person relying on the captions to comprehend the Programs. As such, the captioning was not meaningful to viewers relying on captions.

Table 1 - Program 1 (A Remarkable Place to Die) broadcast on 24 November 2024

Timestamp	Key issue	Relevant provision of the Standard / Issue / Description of content
20:03:38	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(i)
		The words 'It was open when I got here' were not captioned.
20:03:44	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'Someone must have been in the mine' were captioned as 'Someone must have'.
20:07:05	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'and I thought maybe we needed some time to clear the air' was captioned as 'and I thought maybe we needed some time'.
20:10:56	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'There's lots of volunteers with access though' was captioned as 'There's lots of volunteers'.
20:13:28	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'I found this torch next to him, under the rocks' was captioned as 'I found this torch next'.
20:14:01	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'Looks like he dropped it as the rocks came down' were captioned as 'Looks like he dropped it as he'.
20:15:36	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'Driver's licence is registered to a Westport address' was captioned as 'Drivers licence is registered'.
20:15:40	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'We think the shovel is something he had with him. Martyn Fearnly the volunteer who does the tours says there were no hand
		tools on display in that tunnel' were captioned as 'We think the shovel is Martyn Fearnley, says there were no hand tools on'.
20:15:47	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'Janice from the museum said it dates back mid to late 19 th century' were captioned as 'Janice from the museum said it dates'.

Timestamp	Key issue	Relevant provision of the Standard /
Timestamp	ricy issue	Issue / Description of content
20:16:12	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'We've also put in some leg work around town, got a couple of confirmed sightings. The cap he was wearing was distinctive. He was seen in the company of another man over a few days, a week ago. Must have been staying somewhere in the area. We've tried the hotels, motels too, no go' were captioned as 'We've also put in some got a couple The cap he was wearing He was seen in the company over a few days – a week ago Must have been staying We've tried the hotel, motels too'.
20:16:32	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'In the meantime we've blown up a picture from his driver licence, we'll get that posted around town.' Was captioned as 'And meantime, we've blown up a We'll get that'.
20:16:41	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'No I need you pushing for results on that gold, and follow up on anything that the boss gets from Westport. I want to know who his buddy is and where' was captioned as 'No, I need you pushing And follow up on anything I want to know who his'.
20:16:51	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words' Oh hey by the way I already sent off that baggy for testing with the other stuff from the scene' was captioned as 'Oh, hey, by the way, for testing with the other'.
20:16:54	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What baggy? Oh um just something I spotted on the ground outside the mine. Probably unrelated dropped by a tourist or something but worth checking out' was captioned as 'UmOh just something I spotted on Probably un related Dropped by a tourist worth checking out Great'.
20:17:50	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'He was found in a gold mine, but I'm pretty sure he's a tourist, as opposed to a miner' were captioned as 'And ah just to be clear But pretty sure he's'.
20:18:42	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Obviously after the investigation. Well after the investigation tends to turn into weeks, so what are you doing tomorrow night' was captioned as 'Obviously, after Well, after the investigation So, what are you'.

Timestamp	Key issue	Relevant provision of the Standard / Issue / Description of content
20:43:01	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'over a century ago, yes, but they could still be relevant constable' were captioned as 'But it could'.
20:43:53	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'maybe there is no record because Liam was murdered' were captioned as 'Maybe there's no record'.
20:45:12	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'I spotted you across a crowded room' were captioned as "I spotted you across'.
20:45:37	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'I've forgotten how pervasive that is here' were captioned as 'I've forgotten how'.
20:53:08	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'I hear you've got some more information for us' were captioned as 'I hear you've got'.
21:01:08	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words' You must be exhausted if you've been here all night' were captioned as 'You must be exhausted'.
21:02:54	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'So I would say he's been dead a few days longer than our goldmine victim' were captioned as 'So I would say he's been than our goldmine victim'.
21:03:55	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'Do you think this was done by the same person' were captioned as 'Do you think it was'.
21:04:09	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'I just need to go and see my mum' were captioned as 'I just need to go'.
21:05:42	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'You went to school with my daughter' were captioned as 'You went to school'.
21:06:27	Accuracy Comprehensibility	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) and 12(b)(i)
	Comprononsistinty	The words 'You have no right to come barging in like that' were captioned as 'You have no right to come'.
		The captions did not change colour to indicate speech of an off screen speaker. This made the captions incomprehensible.

Relevant provision of the Standard / Issue / Description of content			
21:06:37 Accuracy Comprehensibility The words 'Since she married him, with his backing, she has made a huge success of her life' were captioned as 'Wel, since she married him, she has made a huge success of her life' were captioned as 'Wel, since she married him, she has made a huge.' The caption of an off screen speaker. This made the captions incomprehensible. 21:38:03 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'You think he's going after Ed Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'the was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'Gan you took Ed's teeth and burded them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'Gan you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord 'Gan you tie his wrists with the cord 'Gan you tie his wrists with the cord 'Gan you tie his wrists with the cord 'Ga	Timestamp	Key issue	•
backing, she has made a huge success of her life' were captioned as 'Wel,' since she married him, she has made a huge'. The captions did not change colour to indicate speech of an off screen speaker. This made the captions incomprehensible. 21:38:03 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'You think he's going after Ed Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him'. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about were captioned as 'Can you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words	21:06:37		
Ilfe' were captioned as 'Well, since she married him, she has made a huge'. The captions did not change colour to indicate speech of an off screen speaker. This made the captions incomprehensible. 21:38:03 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'You think he's going after Ed Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. 21:38:41 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he 'Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth' 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you te his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
The captions did not change colour to indicate speech of an off screen speaker. This made the captions incomprehensible. 21:38:03 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'You think he's going after Ed Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. 21:38:41 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned as 'We saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(iii)			
indicate speech of an off screen speaker. This made the captions incomprehensible. 21:38:03 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'You think he's going after Ed Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Wapbe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton's were not captioned as 'We saw you and your' brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			married him, she has made a huge'.
indicate speech of an off screen speaker. This made the captions incomprehensible. 21:38:03 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'You think he's going after Ed Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Wapbe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton's were not captioned as 'We saw you and your' brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			The captions did not change colour to
21:38:03 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'You think he's going after Ed Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. 21:38:41 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him? Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Llams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth' and buried them at Llams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			indicate speech of an off screen speaker.
The words 'You think he's going after Ed Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. 21:38:41 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Llams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Llams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			This made the captions incomprehensible.
Templeton's half brother as well' were captioned as 'You think he's going after Ed'. 21:38:41 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21:38:03	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
21:38:41 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him'. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
21:38:41 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him? 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(iii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			· ·
getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him'. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)	21:38:41	Accuracy	
getting closure for his grandad' were captioned as 'Maybe this whole thing is just him'. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)			The words 'Maybe this whole thing is just him
him'. 21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			getting closure for his grandad' were
21:39:05 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'This is it, Nathan Templeton's place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21:39:05	Accuracy	
place' were not captioned. 21:50:06 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(i) The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton' were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			The words 'This is it. Nathan Templeton's
The words "the murder of Edward Templeton" were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21:50:06	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(i)
were not captioned. 21:50:29 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			The words 'the murder of Edward Templeton'
The words 'we saw you and your brother fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Gan you tie his wrists with the cord'. Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			were not captioned.
fighting on CCTV' were captioned as 'We saw you and your'. 21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21:50:29	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
21:50:36 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
The words 'What was the gold that he brought with him all about' were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21.50.26	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11/bVii)
brought with him all about, were captioned as 'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21.30.30	Accuracy	
'What was the gold that he'. 21:51:01 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
The words 'That's why you took Ed's teeth and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			'What was the gold that he'.
and buried them at Liams's grave' were captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21:51:01	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
captioned as 'That's why you took Ed's teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
teeth'. 21:51:15 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
The words 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			teeth'.
cord that you got from Ed's place' were captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21:51:15	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
captioned as 'Can you tie his wrists with the cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
cord'. 21:51:23 Accuracy Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why			
The words 'So why take Ed Templeton's ring and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	04.54.00		cord'.
and earing' were captioned as 'So then why	21:51:23	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)

Timestamp	Key issue	Relevant provision of the Standard / Issue / Description of content
21:52:16	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'lock him up so I could finish what I started' were captioned as 'lock him up so'.
21:54:35	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Then he took the keys back to the museum' were captioned as 'Then he took the keys'.

Table 2 - Program 2 (Chicago Med) broadcast on 2 December 2024

Timestamp	Key issue	Relevant provision of the Standard / Issue / Description of content
22:37:57	Accuracy Comprehensibility	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) and 12(b)(i) The words 'This is Doctor Collins. She started at our centre. I think I've seen you around the hospital. Just so you know your son, he's been a real godsend' were captioned as 'This is Doctor Collins. She started our centre. I think I've seen Just so you know'. The captions did not identify speakers with different colours This made the captions incomprehensible.
22:38:37	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Buddy boy. Happy one year sober. Congratulations on this milestone. Speech speech. Nailed it. Speech. OK ok ok. I actually have a lot of thank yous' were captioned as 'Buddy Boy! Speech Speech. I actually have a lot of thank yous'.
22:46:19	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Any chance these are early signs of pregnancy? We've been trying. Well, it's hard to say, but we can get a full work up, including pregnancy test. Sound good? were captioned as 'Any chance these We've been trying. But we can get a full work up, sound good?
22:53:17	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Besides this little goose egg. Any dizziness or lightheadedness? No occasional headaches. But that's probably just because I've been hitting dollar Margarita night a little too hard. I know I shouldn't, but a dollar.' were captioned as 'Besides this little goose egg. No occasional headaches. Because I've been hitting dollar. I know I shouldn't, but a dollar'.

T:	V	Delevent previous of the Oten dead /
Timestamp	Key issue	Relevant provision of the Standard / Issue / Description of content
22:53:47	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'Approaching two decades cancer free and clear. Wow that's fantastic' were captioned as 'Approaching two decades Wow. That's fantastic'.
23:01:21	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'So your CT scan showed a tumour in your neck and it's compressing your carotid artery. Explains your headaches and unsteadiness' were captioned as 'So your CT scan And it's compressing Explains your headaches'.
23:05:19	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii)
		The words 'Now, radiation is not going to do us much good here, Dennis. This tumour is completely encasing her artery. I need to take it out.
		And once I shrink it you'll be in a far better position to do that. Hillary and I discussed all the options and it's clear that radiation is the best place to start'.
		Were captioned as 'Now, radiation's not This tumour is completely I need to take it out. And once I shrink it, you being in a far better Hillary and I discussed and it's clear that radiation'.
23:13:19	Accuracy Comprehensibility	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) and 12(b)(i) The words 'AlrightI'm pinching the pulmonary artery now. I need a Satinsky clamp. Wait, what are you doing? What are you doing? I need to perform a formal lobectomy? Your going to remove a whole lobe of her lung? Its that or let her bleed to death' were captioned as 'Alright, I'm pinching I need a Satinsky clamp. Wait, what are you doing? What are you doing? I need to perform You're gonna remove Its that or let her bleed to death'. The captions for this scene in an operating theatre did not identify speakers with different colours. This made the captions incomprehensible.
23:15:53	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'So Jason thinks that a disruption in his routine killed his father when he was a little kid. So then this morning, after he messes up his steps and the revolving door, he becomes convinced that his mum is next. That's why the the second heart attack becomes so important to him, because he, he thinks that that's

Timestamp	Key issue	Relevant provision of the Standard / Issue / Description of content
		going to restore symmetry' were captioned as 'So Jason thinks killed his father So then this morning, in the revolving door, he becomes convinced That's why that the second heart because he-he thinks'.
23:19:15	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'I'm afraid, radiation is no longer viable. And Hillary is refusing to consent unless you're on board' were captioned as 'I'm afraid radiation And Hillary is refusing'.
23:25:27	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Dr Marcel and I had a little dust up. Sorry, you got put in a difficult position' were captioned as 'Dr Marcel and I Sorry you got'.
23:26:05	Accuracy	Subparagraph 11(b)(ii) The words 'Cardiology placed one stent into his right coronary artery. Thankfully, the damage to his heart was minimal' were captioned as:' Cardiology placed one stent Thankfully, the damage'.

Extract of Licensee's submission to the ACMA

Extract of Licensee's submission dated 13 January 2025

[...]

Upon receiving your below complaint, we promptly engaged our playout provider to investigate the matter.

Their investigation identified an incorrect setting in the playout system that resulted in the faulty replication of captions.

We are pleased to confirm that this issue has now been fully resolved. Additionally, a comprehensive review of all settings across all channels we provide has been conducted to ensure such errors are prevented in the future.